The Board of Education met in regular session on November 17, 2021, in the Circleville City Schools Alumni Room, 388 Clark Drive, Circleville, Ohio at 7:00 p.m. President Tony Reeser called the meeting to order.

On roll call, the following members were present: Tony Reeser, Patty Rothe, Jeff Burrow, Chris Wagner, and Todd Steven

**Public Participation**
- Erica Morgan – spoke about her concern over the district Chromebook form

**Legislative Report** – Patty Rothe

**Superintendent’s Report** – Dr. Kimberly Halley
- Storage facility update
- Data Audit - Departmental Statistics and Data Overview
- State of the Schools - Wednesday - March 2, 2022 at 6:00 p.m.

**Treasurer’s Report** – Kristen Rhoads

ANNUAL PUBLIC NOTICE OF FEDERAL FUNDS
Circleville City Schools District receives funds through the Ohio Department of Education via the Consolidated Continuous Improvement Plan (CCIP). Monies received through the IDEA-Part B (516) are used to provide special education services for students with identified disabilities. Title I (572) funds are used to provide reading and early literacy interventions to all students. Title II (590) funds are used to reduce class size in early grades and to provide professional development services. IDEA funds (587) are used for Special Education services for preschool students. 21st Century Community Learning Centers (509) provides funds to create academic enrichment opportunities during non-school hours. Funds received from the Striving Readers Comprehensive Literacy Grant (599) are used to improve language and literacy development in grades 6 through 12. Monies received through the IDEA-Part B (34 CFR 2=300.165, 34 CFR 300.201) are used to provide special education services for students with identified disabilities for the use of ARP IDEA Part B Special Education funds.

On a motion by Mr. Reeser, seconded by Mrs. Rothe, the agenda be approved, as presented.

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes
On a motion by Mr. Wagner, seconded by Mr. Burrow, the Board approved the October 13, 2021, Regular Meeting, as presented:

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

On a motion by Mr. Burrow, seconded by Mrs. Rothe, the Board approved the Agreement with the Circleville Education Association for the swimming coach supplemental, as presented.

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

On a motion by Mr. Reeser, seconded by Mr. Wagner, the Board approved the following personnel items, as presented:

**2021-2022 School Year**

**Substitute Assignment:**
- Mark Roe
  - Custodian
  - Retroactive: November 1, 2021
- Andrew Lowe
  - Educational Aide

**Classified:**
- Shannon Foggin
  - Educational Aide - CES
  - 182 day Calendar
  - Retroactive: November 1, 2021
- Kimberlee Fait
  - Educational Aide - CES
  - 182 day Calendar
  - Retroactive: October 25, 2021
- Harlee Buxbaum
  - Educational Aide - CMS
  - 182 day Calendar
  - Retroactive: November 1, 2021
Extra Mile Afterschool Programs:
• Lisa Sims  Substitute Tutor
• Lindsey Sullivan  Substitute Tutor
• Jennifer Schmidt  Educational Aide
  Retroactive: October 26, 2021

Athletics:
• Gerald (Rich) Hixon  Bowling CHS Head Coach (Split)
  Years of Experience: 0
• Michael Williams  Swimming CHS Head Coach
  Years of Experience: 2
• Randy Brown  Boys Biddy Basketball Volunteer
• Matthew Fosnaugh  Boys Biddy Basketball Volunteer
• Kyle Leasure  Boys Biddy Basketball Volunteer
• Jonathan Davis  Boys Biddy Basketball Volunteer
• Mark Hamman-Yablonski  Girls Biddy Basketball Volunteer
• Amanda Ramey  Girls Biddy Basketball Volunteer
• Charles (Chuck) Sims  Girls Biddy Basketball Volunteer
• Christopher (Chad) Michael  Girls Biddy Basketball Volunteer
• Gabrielle (Brie) Kendrick  Girls Biddy Basketball Volunteer

• Gabrielle (Brie) Kendrick  Girls CHS Basketball Assistant Volunteer

• Conrad Rosch  Wrestling CHS Assistant
  Years of Experience: 3

• David Morgan  Wrestling CMS Assistant
  Years of Experience: 3

• Deborah McDaniel  Cheerleading - Reserve
  Years of Experience: 3

• Robert (Josh) Rodich  Boys Varsity Basketball Assistant
  Years of Experience: 0

• Mason Kauffeld  Football CHS Assistant
  Years of Experience: 0

• Trenton Brooks  Wrestling CHS Head Varsity
  Years of Experience: 15+

**Supplementals:**

**CHS:**

• Sonsearay Grady  CHS - National Art Honor Society
  Superintendent Approved

**Resignation:**

• Jackie VanArsdalen  Student Services Administrative Assistant
  Effective: February 28, 2022

• Charles (Butch) Hughes  Teacher CHS - Industrial Technology
  Effective: August 31, 2022

**Retirements:**

• Diane Brobeck  Teacher CES - Tiger Remote Learning
  Effective: December 31, 2021

• Carol Johnson  Teacher CES - Grade 3
  Effective: May 31, 2022
Unpaid Leave:
- Jaime McKeivier February 25, 2022

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

On a motion by Mr. Stevens, seconded by Mr. Burrow, the Board approved the 2022 - 2023 School Calendar, as presented.

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

On a motion by Mr. Stevens, seconded by Mrs. Rothe, the Board approve the decommissioning and disposal of the following school busses, as presented:
- 1BABKCXA24F214584, Bluebird, Bus Number 22 - Trade in Value $1,500
- 1BABNCXA54F217366, Bluebird, Bus Number 23 - Trade in Value $1,500
- 1BABNCXA85F220169, Bluebird, Bus Number 24 - Trade in Value $1,200

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

On a motion by Mr. Stevens, seconded by Mr. Burrow, the Board approved the purchase of two (2) 81 passenger school busses, from the META bid, as presented.

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes
On a motion by Mr. Reeser, seconded by Mr. Wagner, the Board approved the following Student Services Agreements, as presented:

- Ambassador Nursing - one-to-one services for special needs student at CES for the remainder of FY22
  
  This contract is for skilled nursing service provided by Ambassador Home Health Services located at 6954 Americana Parkway, Reynoldsburg, Ohio 43068 and Circleville City Schools located at 100 Tiger Drive, Circleville, Ohio 43113, for services provided to Lane Booth.

  This contract is for skilled nursing services provided for the remainder of the 2021 school year beginning mid-November, and the 2022 school year.

  The hours will be from 8:15 am to 4:30 pm Monday-Friday except for holidays and/or sick days, services will be provided by an LPN/RN.

  Circleville City Schools will reimburse Ambassador Home Health Services at $30.00 per hour. Ambassador Home Health will bill Circleville City Schools monthly; payment is due within 7 days of receipt of bill.

  Either party may dissolve contract with or without cause by giving a 30-day written notice.

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

On a motion by Mrs. Rothe, seconded by Mr. Burrow, the Board approved the revised Gifted Handbook, as presented.

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes
On a motion by Mr. Reeser, seconded by Mr. Burrow, the Board approved the following policies, as presented:

- po0169.1
- po1530
- po1617
- po2271
- po2370.01
- po3271
- po4271
- po5111
- po5111
- po5200
- po5350
- po5408
- po5516
- po6114
- po7300
- po7450
- po8330
- po8400
- po8462
- po8600
- po8651
- po8740

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

On a motion by Mr. Stevens, seconded by Mrs. Rothe, the Board approved the temporary resolution to expand employment of substitute teachers pursuant to Ohio Senate Bill 1, as presented.

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

On a motion by Mr. Reeser, seconded by Mr. Stevens, the Board recognized the statement attesting to the adoption of board policy po8500 that considers the requirements of Ohio Revised Code 3313.814 regarding nutritional compliance in the food service guidelines, as presented.

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes
On a motion by Mr. Stevens, seconded by Mr. Wagner, the Board approved the following agreements with the Pickaway County Educational Service Center, as presented:

- **American Rescue Plan- Homeless RND1**

  This agreement between the Pickaway County Educational Service Center and Circleville City Schools is for support of an Educational Tutor for Homeless students as services provided by the Pickaway County Educational Service Center to Circleville City Schools during 2 school years FY22 & FY23 under the American Rescue Plan-Homeless (ARP 507.9122)

  Circleville City Schools will invoice the Pickaway County Educational Service Center $12,800 in April 2022 and again in April of 2023 for Educational Tutor for the homeless student support.

  These PCESC services are from September 1, 2021 through June 30, 2023. Pickaway County Educational Service Center will pay Circleville City Schools for homeless education services $12,800 in FY22 and FY23. Circleville City Schools will be identifying homeless children and youth, and reporting of time and effort around the tutoring services while PCESC will provide the homeless children and youth with wrap-around services to address the challenges of COVID-19, and to enable homeless children and youth to attend school and fully participate in school activities.

  Circleville City Schools agrees to hold harmless the Pickaway County Educational Service Center for any unemployment or workers’ compensation claims as a result of this agreement, and understands that any unemployment or workers’ compensation claims shall become the responsibility of the employing district.

- **Substitute Bus Driver Incentive Program**

  This agreement between the Pickaway County Educational Service Center and Circleville City Schools is for support of a PAY INCENTIVE for Bus Drivers at Circleville City Schools (the District) meeting criteria set forth by the District and paid to the Driver as services provided by the Pickaway County Educational Service Center.

  Circleville City Schools will invoice the Pickaway County Educational Service Center for each Bus Driver with the PAY INCENTIVE amount to be paid and include a completed W9 form and email address for each driver approved by the District to be paid. Payments are made to the approved via budgetary check as a 1099 vendor.

  These PCESC services are from September 1, 2021 through June 30, 2022. Pickaway County Educational Service Center will invoice Circleville City Schools for Bus Driver Recruitment and Retention services provided to include the customary administrative fee.

  Circleville City Schools agrees to hold harmless the Pickaway County Educational Service Center for any unemployment or workers’ compensation claims as a result of this agreement, and understands that any unemployment or workers’ compensation claims shall become the responsibility of the employing district.

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes
On a motion by Mr. Wagner, seconded by Mr. Reeser, approved the letter regarding HB126 to amend section 5715.19 of the Ohio Revised Code, regarding the process for local governments to contest property value, as presented:

Dear Chairman Blessing, Vice Chair Roegner, Ranking Member Williams, and members of the Senate Ways and Means Committee:

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on H.B. 126 which proposes adjustments to the procedures for challenging property value at the Board of Revision. In general, we join with others in supporting the purpose of the initial bill—increasing transparency and accountability for local governments contesting property values. We hope the committee would still consider some adjustment to that proposed procedure. In addition, we strongly oppose the proposed amendment which instead of adding guard rails to local government complaints would prohibit them entirely.

The current Board of Revision process supplements the mass appraisal work conducted by County auditors.

A primary purpose of the Board of Revision is to hear and decide complaints that the Auditor did not set a property value correctly. The Auditor’s values are determined by computer assisted mass appraisal and are adjusted County wide only once every three years. Some parcels will be adjusted outside of the three-year cycle due to annual maintenance of the tax duplicate which includes new construction and other changes to property. While every single parcel is reviewed, the nature of appraising an entire County means that the values are set through a more holistic process necessary to both complete the work efficiently and consistently for the County. Standards for mass appraisal are set in Ohio law with rules, guidance, and oversight provided by the tax commission.

This process is an effective means of setting taxable value, but there are times when more individualized attention is needed to find the correct value for a parcel and Board of Revision complaints serve this purpose. Boards of Revisions routinely consider complex appraisal and economic evidence in determining the appropriate value after a complaint. The process is balanced because both property owners and local government entities (1) can challenge value or counter any filed claim.

(1) Under R.C. 5715.19, all local government entities are eligible to file complaints or counter complaints at the Board of Revision. In practice, Boards of Education are the only entities who regularly file such complaints though their involvement can protect the interest of all overlapping taxing authorities.

The ability of multiple parties to file helps keep decisions balanced with some property values being reduced and others being increased based on the evidence presented.

The complaint and hearing process is designed for review of an individual property and the Auditor’s value is presumed to be accurate. This means that those filing complaints will need to show their claimed value is based on the property and not simply argue based on economic conditions or a burdensome tax rate which is largely determined by voter approved levies. The information gathered and resulting decisions create the correct taxable value for that property owner and can help inform future appraisal decisions.

Additional transparency and accountability can support the Board of Revision and appraisal process.

The bill as initially introduced to require the local government legislative body to approve complaint filings would strengthen the board of revision process. We would like to see changes to the bill as it is currently pending to limit the administrative burden on complaint filings. This could include allowing for a single resolution listing all properties on which a complaint can be filed, allowing for counterclaims without a resolution, and streamlining the notice requirements. We would also support the option suggested by other witnesses to require the adoption of a policy for when and how complaints would occur rather than signing off on individual properties.

The proposed amendment requiring the reporting of any side agreements or settlements of property value disputes would add additional transparency and give auditors more complete information for future appraisal work. Settlements can be an important part of any dispute, but secret agreements undermine the goal of fair property values for both individual owners and communities as a whole.

Prohibiting local government property value complaints will create one-sided arguments and can harm all taxpayers.

Many of the proponents of this bill assert that the property challenge process is abused by local governments, namely local schools.

Both the school board complaints and critically counter-complaints make sure that the Board of Revision is not only asked to lower property values. Often school board representatives present evidence of property investment or a sale that for a variety of reasons has not yet been considered by our appraisal process. Understandably, property owners almost exclusively request that their appraised value be reduced. In contrast when school boards file complaints they assert an increased value is warranted. In the case of counter-complaints, the countering party often helps defend the auditor’s value or argue for a compromise value change. Without this option, Board of Revision decisions would serve only to lower the overall tax base.

Balanced Board of Revision decisions are not only important to auditors and local governments, but also to every taxpayer in that jurisdiction. Every year tax rates are set or equalized by the Department of Taxation to make sure that property value changes still result in the correct amount being collected for each applicable levy. When a property value is changed at the Board of Revision, that new value is included in the following tax
year calculation. If the Board of Revision universally lowers property values, tax rates will increase over time ultimately harming those who do not challenge their value.

Conclusion

Board of Revision complaints by property owners and local government entities are an important supplement to the mass appraisal process. Existing procedures and several of the measures proposed in this legislation can increase public awareness and accountability for local government decisions. We implore the committee to consider these guard rails but reject upending the current complaint process by making all claims one-sided and cutting off the ability of local governments to participate in this process.

Thank you for your consideration of this important legislation and the opportunity to review Board of Revision procedures.

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

On a motion by Mr. Reeser, seconded by Mrs. Rothe, the Board approved the changes to Companion Life Insurance, as presented.

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

On a motion by Mr. Stevens, seconded by Mr. Reeser the Board approve the Five Year Forecast, as presented:

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

On a motion by Mr. Reeser, seconded by Mrs. Rothe, the Board approved the following Treasurer’s items, as presented:

Reports:
- Financial Reports - October 2021
- Warrants - October 2021

Requisitions Over $10,000:
- VALLEY WHOLESALE FOODS - food and supplies (Nov-Dec) - $20,000.00 (006-0000)
- STRATEGIC TURF SOLUTIONS - aerator and slit drainage equipment - $11,900.00 (001-0000)
- AMBASSADOR HOME HEALTH - nursing services - $32,190.00 (001-0000)
- XTEK PARTNERS - district camera equipment - $156,215.00 (001-0000)
- OHIO MACHINERY CO. (OHIO CAT) - 2 school busses - $212,020.00 (507-9022)
- TRAFAERA HOLDINGS - laptops and monitors - $122,420.00 (003-9001)
After the Facts:
- VALLEY WHOLESALE FOODS - food and supplies (October) - $6,869.00
- SPIRES PEST CONTROL - pest control treatment - $583.00
- COLUMBUS BUILDING SERVICES - HVAC repairs - $2,248.00
- SCHOLASTIC - HS books - $274.73
- ECOLAB - cafeteria supplies - $1399.44

Donations:
- Chase Bank - to Circleville City Schools - $400
- Pickaway County Board of Developmental Disabilities - to CCS Nursing Department-Vision Screening light box, Audiometer, and Scales
- Ohio Pickleball Association - to Circleville City Schools - Pickleball equipment

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

Board President's Comments:
- Welcome newly elected Board of Education members
- OSBA Capital Conference delegate meeting report- Jeff Burrow
- Finance Committee report- Chris Wagner
- Meeting request from Swing State Strategies

On a motion by Mr. Reeser and seconded by Mr. Burrow, the Board voted to enter into executive session at 7:55 p.m. in accordance with (O.R.C. 121.22G) (a) consideration of the appointment, employment, dismissal, discipline, promotion, demotion, or compensation of a public employee, or official and (h) Consideration of confidential information related to the marketing plans, specific business strategy, production techniques, trade secrets or personal financial statements of an applicant for economic development assistance, or to negotiations with other political subdivisions respecting requests for economic development assistance, provided that both of the following conditions apply:
1. the information is directly related to a request for economic development assistance that is to be provided or administered fewer than one of the statutes referenced in R.C. 121.22(G)(6)(1), or that involves public infrastructure improvements or the extension of utility services that are directly related to an economic development project, and
2. an unanimous quorum of the Board or its subcommittee determines, by a roll call vote, that the executive session is necessary to protect the interests of the applicant or the possible investment or expenditure of public funds to be made connection with the economic development project.

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe - yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

The Board returned to general session at 8:35 p.m.
On a motion by Mr. Stevens, seconded by Mr. Burrow the Board approved the job description as presented

Mr. Reeser – yes; Mrs. Rothe – yes; Mr. Burrow – yes; Mr. Wagner – yes; Mr. Stevens - yes

On a motion by Mr. Stevens, seconded by Mr. Burrow, the Board voted to adjourn the meeting at 8:38 p.m.

[Signature]
President

[Signature]
ATTEST
Treasurer